

Part I

Main Author: Kerrie Charles
Executive Member: Cllr. S. Boulton
Ward: Hollybush

WELWYN HATFIELD BOROUGH COUNCIL
ESTATE MANAGEMENT SCHEME PANEL -18 OCTOBER 2018
REPORT OF THE CORPORATE DIRECTOR (PUBLIC PROTECTION, PLANNING
AND GOVERNANCE)

6/2018/0776/EM

11 LADY GROVE WELWYN GARDEN CITY AL7 4DS

ERECTION OF A FRONT PORCH, ALTERATION OF ELEVATIONS AND THE
REMOVAL OF A FRONT HEDGE

APPLICANT: Mr P Shah

(Hollybush)

1. Background

- 1.1. The appeal is against the refusal of Estate Management Consent for the “erection of a front porch, alterations of elevations and the removal of a front hedge”. The application (reference: 6/2018/0776/EM) was refused on the 29 May 2018 for the following reason:

“The proposed front porch and the part removal of front boundary hedge would not be in keeping with the host dwelling, the area and its immediate context and would be detrimental to the amenities and values of the existing area. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Policy EM1 of the Welwyn Garden City Estates Management Scheme”.

2. Site Description

- 2.1. The appeal site, 11 Lady Grove, is a semi-detached dwelling with a pitched roof. The dwelling is located on the south side of Lady Grove, which connects Linkfield and Boundary Lane.
- 2.2. The properties within Lady Grove follow a common pattern in that, the front entrances are often located on the side elevations of semi-detached and end of terrace dwellings in the street.

3. The Proposal

- 3.1. The proposal seeks Estate Management Consent to erect a porch with a new front door on the front elevation; to replace an existing door on the side elevation with a window and to remove the front boundary hedge.

4. Relevant Estate Management History

- 4.1 No history

5. Policy

- 5.1. Estate Management Scheme Policies (October 2008)

EM1 – Extensions and Alterations

EM3 – Soft and Hard Landscaping

6. Representations Received

- 6.1. No representations have been received.

7. Discussion

- 7.1. This is an appeal against the refusal of Estate Management Consent. The appellant's letter of appeal is attached at Appendix 1 and the original officer's report for application referenced 6/2018/0776/EM is attached at Appendix 2.
- 7.2. The key issue in the determination of this appeal is the impact of the proposed development upon the amenities and values of the Garden City.
- 7.3. In recognition of the importance of Welwyn Garden City as a unique town and in order to protect the amenities and values of the Garden City, the Estate Management Scheme was set up. The purpose of the Estate Management Scheme and its importance to homeowners is to ensure that homes and street scenes are kept in harmony with the original designs and concepts of the town.
- 7.4. Policy EM1 of the Estate Management Scheme (EMS) refers to extensions and alterations, and states that extensions and alterations will only be allowed where the works are in keeping with the design, appearance, materials and architectural detail used in the existing building, and would not harm the amenities and values of the area.
- 7.5. Lady Grove is characterised with a mixture of semi-detached and terraced properties. A common architectural design of the semi-detached and end of terrace properties involves the use of entrance doors on the side elevation (rather than the front elevation) that is symmetrical to the adjacent semi-detached and terraced dwellings.
- 7.6. The appeal dwelling and its neighbour at number 9 each have side facing doors and a shared access drive between them. They also have other features and characteristics common to a Welwyn Garden City dwelling in terms of materials and neo-Georgian glazing design and hedges screening the front garden area.
- 7.7. The proposal would include relocating the entrance to the front elevation and enclosing it within a new front porch measuring 2.4m by 1.25m. The porch would appear alien within the streetscene and would be detrimental to the character and surrounding area and would also disrupt the relative symmetry within the streetscene and therefore fail to comply with Policy EM1.

- 7.8. Front boundary hedges are a common feature within Lady Grove and within the Estate Management Scheme area. Although part of the hedge would be retained, no justification was been put forward with the application to explain why the removal is necessary. The loss of hedgerows and planting to front gardens within the Estate Management Area would conflict with the stated objectives of Policy EM3.
- 7.9. The proposed development would not preserve the unique architectural heritage of the town as it causes harm to the character and appearance of the building and the wider street scene thus resulting in harm to the amenities and values of the Garden City contrary to Policy EM1.
- 7.10. A case has been advanced by the appellant in support of the appeal. The appellant outlines that on this street some properties have small, porch like entrances. House numbers: 17, 19, 37 and 41 Lady Grove. Little evidence has been put forward to support this assessment and no application history can be found for these properties, which suggest the works may have been carried out without consent.
- 7.11. The appellant also remarks that the shared access between his and his neighbours home would make a porch over the existing door both impractical and unneighbourly as it would limit the shared access space.
- 7.12. In regards to the hedge the appellant has stated that the existing hedge is uneven and impractical and does not match other hedges on the other side of the property. He also mentions that there is other properties that do not have hedge.
- 7.13. Photographs of the shared access and hedgerow provided by the appellant are attached at Appendix 3.
- 7.14. The appellant has also submitted plans showing a smaller porch but this appeal relates to the originally submitted proposal as described above.
- 7.15. Despite the appellants submissions it is not considered that a compelling case has been advanced to demonstrate why, when considered in its context, the proposals should be permitted overriding the wider values and amenities of Lady Grove and Welwyn Garden City Estate Management Area.
- 7.16. It is still considered that the proposal fails to reflect the character and appearance of the properties where it is located and the streetscene of Lady Grove. The proposed development therefore fails to maintain the amenities and values of the Estate Management Area.

8. Conclusion

- 8.1. No substantial additional evidence or information has been put forward by the appellant which adds to or would alter the officer's recommendation. The proposed porch of and the removal of the hedge, would be unacceptable and have a detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the appeal

property, the row of terrace properties in which it is located and the surrounding street scene. Therefore the relocation of the front entrance and porch and the removal of the front boundary hedge would cause harm to the values and amenities of the area and the proposal fails to accord with Policy EM1 of the Welwyn Garden City Estate Management Scheme.

9. Recommendation

- 9.1. That the Members uphold the delegated decision and dismiss the appeal.

Name of Author: Kerrie Charles
Title: Assistant Planning and Enforcement Officer
Date: 18 October 2018

Background papers:

- Appendix 1: Appellants grounds of appeal
- Appendix 2: Original delegated officer's report
- Appendix 3: Appellant's photographs 1 - 5



 WELWYN HATFIELD <small>Council Offices, The Campus Welwyn Garden City, Herts, AL8 6AE</small>	Title: 11 Lady Grove Welwyn Garden City	Scale: DNS
		Date: 2018
Project: EMAP Committee	Drawing No: 6/2018/0776/EM	Drawn: Ida Moesner
© Crown Copyright. All rights reserved Welwyn Hatfield Borough Council LA100019547 2018		